Addressing educator shortages and improving workforce diversity

General Meeting
January 31, 2022
Background

● Pandemic-related labor supply shortages and increased demand have **exacerbated chronic staffing challenges** in public schools nationwide

● Overall shortages linked to **insufficient workforce diversity** (e.g., SMC Grand Jury report); educator diversity **critical to equitable student outcomes**

● Opportunities reach **beyond increasing funding/salaries/wages**; further investment at all levels (e.g., national to local) and sectors (e.g., public to non-profit) are **essential** (e.g., credentialing programs and HR processes, non-profit programs, affordable housing)

● Workforce spending typically ~90% of school district budgets, thus **potentially our greatest opportunity to improve student outcomes** and **systemic financial sustainability**, further to ongoing advocacy for full and fair funding
Let’s learn more and explore…

- **Today (zoom):** Overview of the situation/progress in addressing the overall educator shortage and supporting diversity in CA and SMC

- **February (zoom):** Panel of district leaders share their experiences

- **March/April (in person TBC):** Brief recap; interactive, small group discussions to explore potential partnerships and next steps
  - CA advocacy
  - SMC programs
  - District best practices
California

Where we are today

[CTC] needs to credential around 20,000 new teachers each year. In 2020, CTC only credentialed around 14,000 new teachers, which is a shortage of 6,000 teachers [resulting from that year alone].

Sources: EdSource, Teacher Certification Degrees, KTVU
California: The progress

- **Key credentialing programs ongoing:** Golden State Teacher Grant Program, Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program, National Board Certification Incentive Grant, Teacher Residency Grant Program; TEACH California

- **CTC** variable term waivers permitted for pandemic impact; new pathways for bilingual educators; coursework may now substitute for CBEST/CSET; fee waivers

- **CDE** recruiting 10K mental health counselors; convening Work Group; CSU-Northridge Four-Year Integrated program; financial supports

- **Governor** issued (limited) temporary executive order (e.g., COE tentative substitute permit approvals); ‘Californians for All’ service scholarship program launched

- Also: **One Million Teachers of Color** non-profit initiative launched (nationwide)

Source: EdSource, EdWeek, CTC, CSBA, CDE, CSUN, Public Advocates, CDE teacher pipeline financial supports; Californians for All
San Mateo County

Where we are today

- 72% students and 26% of public school students and educators, respectively, are non-white
- Districts reporting widespread staffing shortages across job types despite pandemic relief funding (e.g., teachers, tutors) - e.g., 11 open positions at one local district as of January 2022

SMCOE: Building for Tomorrow
Developing Teachers and Leaders from Within
Workforce Development for Student Success

SMCOE Strategic Plan 2016-2021

Build and strengthen a diverse workforce to support learners age 0-22

Objective A: Finalize and promote a map of the educator/workforce pipeline

Objective B: Prepare a report on the demographic data of students and school staff across the country to understand needs and target supports

Objective D: Develop and implement a teacher residency program

Objective E: Explore and seek funding for a high-quality intern teaching credential program.
Educator Pipeline at SMCOE
The mission and vision that started the SMCOE and Alder GSE partnership:

Outstanding teachers and leaders change students’ lives and make the world better and more just. Our goal is to create opportunity and cultivate success for every K12 student by recruiting and educating excellent teachers and leaders who reflect the schools’ communities.
Who is Alder GSE?
We are a graduate school of education and a powerful community-based professional workforce development pathway.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TK-12 Partnerships</th>
<th>We build and resource partnerships with TK-12 districts, charter management organizations, county offices of education and school operators.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Candidate Preparation</td>
<td>Together, we recruit teacher candidates from the local community and educate them through a one year residency program in the TK–12 school system where they will be employed. Residents earn a teaching credential and Master’s at the end of the year. (WASC and CCTC Accredited)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentor Teacher Development</td>
<td>Mentor teachers host and support residents in their classrooms. Mentor teachers receive professional development as coaches and instructional experts at the school sites.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Alder Outcomes

Alder residents represent the communities they serve
- 76% are from historically underrepresented communities
- 70% are first generation college graduates

Alder residents complete the program at high rates
- 84% complete the program within the one year
- 90% complete with additional time (.5 to one more year)

Alder residents are hired by their placement schools & ranked as highly effective new hires
- Of those who complete, 96% are hired by and for the school system where they were trained
- 95% of Principals rank Alder teachers “more effective or much more effective” than other new teacher hires

Alder residents remain committed to their schools longer
- Significantly longer retention rates for Alder GSE teachers (39% v 61%)
Benefits to Participating Districts

- Improved K12 student learning during mentor/resident year (findings from a third party study)
- A well-trained first year teacher that has received a year of training in and for our schools
- New teacher effectiveness and teacher retention
- Personalized recruiting support that meets the specific needs of our schools and intentionally recruits from within
- More diverse teacher candidate pipeline that reflects the local community
- Mentor teacher professional development
Teacher Residency Program Impact

- **8 Residents**
- **All Ed Specialists**
- **3 Districts**
- **6 schools**

Cohort 1 Resident Diversity:

- African American: 12.5%
- Asian: 25.0%
- Af-Am & Latinx: 25.0%
- White: 12.5%
- Other: 25.0%
- Decline to state: 12.5%
SMCOE/Alder Teacher Residency District Participation

2021-2022 (Cohort 1): 7 residents
- Jefferson Union HSD
- Ravenswood ESD
- San Mateo Foster City SD

2022-2023 (Cohort 2): striving for 23 residents
Committed district partners currently recruiting residents:
- Jefferson Union HSD
- Ravenswood ESD
- San Mateo Foster City SD
- San Mateo Union HSD
- South San Francisco USD
- Bayshore Elementary SD
- Redwood City SD
- Belmont Redwood Shores SD
- San Carlos SD
SMCOE/Alder Teacher Residency
Costs to Districts

• Cost to the district: $20,000 per resident ($17,000 stipend to resident teacher and $3,000 stipend per mentor)
• Coaching for Mentor and Resident at no additional cost
• Sites welcome the resident(s) as members of the school community with access to district technology tools and platforms necessary to perform teaching tasks
• Districts and sites recognize that residents are not interns, student teachers or paras, but rather pre-service teachers who are co-teaching with mentors and supporting students
• Can utilize Teacher Effectiveness Grant $$
Preliminary Administrative Services Credential Program - Overview
## How Do We Develop Local Leadership?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coursework</th>
<th>Fieldwork - Leadership Observations</th>
<th>CalAPA (California Administrator Performance Assessment)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>WHEN:</strong> Tuesdays 4 p.m. -10 p.m.</td>
<td><strong>WHEN:</strong> Eight days of observation of a principal over two school years *currently have a choice board to accommodate all work situations</td>
<td><strong>WHEN:</strong> Beginning July 2019, all preliminary administrative credential programs had to support all candidates to pass this three part assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thirteen courses</td>
<td><strong>WHO:</strong> Principals with clear credentials</td>
<td>. Data analysis/root cause and action planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HOW LONG:</strong> Thirteen months</td>
<td><strong>WHY:</strong> This is the single most powerful way to support a shift in thinking to understand systems leadership.</td>
<td>. Leading a team over time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(February - February)</td>
<td></td>
<td>. Coaching a teacher on California Standards for Teaching Profession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INSTRUCTORS:</strong> Practitioner Guest Instructors</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CONNECTION:</strong> real world application of leadership skills in preparation for credential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COE Instructors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>COST:</strong> $7250 ($80 materials)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
90% of the 177 candidates (total to date) work in San Mateo County.
SFSU Substitute Teacher Project

- SFSU Graduate School Students
- Gain emergency credential through SMCOE
- Available for hire – SMC School Districts
San Mateo County: Districts’ and other local progress

- Districts ramping up efforts → *deeper dive in February!*
  - Staffing up HR departments, expanding recruitment channels (e.g., local newspapers)
  - Partnering with PTOs/non-profits on recruitment, volunteers (e.g., substitutes)
  - High School ‘real life learning’ community service opportunities (e.g., after-school tutoring)
  - Hiring more candidates with intern credentials, permits or waivers rather than full credentials
  - …and more!

- Local non-profits, colleges and universities continue/expand efforts
  - [Ignited Education](#) - summer industry internships for teachers (e.g., STEM)
  - [Notre Dame Du Namur](#), USF, SFSU, Stanford University, UC Berkeley, and others
Spotlight: Districts covering substitute shortages

- **Partnering** with parent and community groups to recruit parent, community volunteers and part-time, temporary workers
- Significantly raising substitute **pay rates**, hiring **full-time** substitutes
- **District staff** substituting in large numbers
Summary and next steps

- Chronic education workforce shortages and diversity insufficiencies have been exacerbated by the pandemic; many efforts are underway at the state/county/local and public/non-profit levels

- Next steps
  - **February**: Panel of district leaders share their experiences → Volunteers?
  - **March/April (in person TBC)**: Brief recap; interactive, small group discussions to explore potential partnerships and next steps
    - CA advocacy
    - SMC programs
    - District best practices
Questions? Comments?
Thank you!
Appendix
Additional references, post-meeting

- CDE Early Educator grant
- CDE Dual Immersion grant
- NOVAWorks Skills-Based Hiring toolkits
Further reading (1)

- SMC Grand Jury Report - Educator Workforce Diversity
- SMCOE Credential Programs
- Researchers urge changes to improve California’s education funding law
- California districts anticipate major hits to their 2022-23 budgets as enrollments drop
- Projected K-12 drops in enrollment pose immediate upheaval and decade-long challenge
- California school districts receive unprecedented windfall but lack teachers to help students catch up
- Closing the Educator Shortage Gap (MASA)
- Sharpening the Divide: How California’s Teacher Shortages Expand Inequality
- Staffing Classrooms in a Time of Shortage (CCEE)
- Four Programs Receive Funding Boosts to Recruit More Teachers and Diversify the Profession (Public Advocates)
- Not enough subs: California schools face severe teacher shortage (CalMatters)
- Average Salaries & Expenditure Percentage - CalEdFacts (CDE)
- Ignited Education
Further reading (2)

- Student Advocates Submit Education Initiative to Attorney General
- How Finance Reform May Alter Teacher and School Quality: California’s $23 Billion Initiative (Lee et al)
- Republicans are coming for California’s public schools. And they could actually win
- New paths for bilingual educators approved by California Commission on Teacher Credentialing
- A guide to making the California teacher shortage even worse
- CSUN to Offer Accelerated Program to Aspiring History Teachers
- ‘Bold, Audacious Goal’: Coalition Pushes to Add More Than 1 Million Educators of Color
- A Campaign for One Million More Teachers of Color
- A broken pipeline: Teacher preparation’s diversity problem
- Is Your State Prioritizing Teacher Diversity & Equity?
- 5 Things to Advance Equity in Access to Strong and Diverse Educators
- Developing a representative and inclusive vision for education
Further reading (3)

- Solutions for the hiring crisis in California school districts
- NOVAWorks Job Board
- CDE teacher career exploration resources
- TEACH California
- California Commission on Teacher Credentialing
- California Center on Teaching Careers
- CDE teacher pipeline financial support
- Graduate Information Forums at Notre Dame de Namur University
- State Slow to Approve Substitute Teachers: Districts Use New Tactics to Fill the Gap
- How Congress can help students learning English
- California woefully lacks Black teachers
- Why we need more Black teachers
- California school districts increase pay, working conditions to ease teacher shortage
- Newsom's education budget is opportunity for California’s workforce talent supply
Further reading (4)

- How Do Educators Feel About Staff Diversity? We Asked
- How Schools Can Support Leaders of Color, According to Experts
- Teacher Shortages During the Pandemic: How California Districts Are Responding
- Graduate Information Forums at Notre Dame de Namur University
- State Slow to Approve Substitute Teachers: Districts Use New Tactics to Fill the Gap
- How Congress can help students learning English
- California woefully lacks Black teachers
- Why we need more Black teachers
- California school districts increase pay, working conditions to ease teacher shortage
- Newsom's education budget is opportunity for California’s workforce talent supply
- How Do Educators Feel About Staff Diversity? We Asked
- How Schools Can Support Leaders of Color, According to Experts
- Teacher Shortages During the Pandemic: How California Districts Are Responding
Next meeting (draft notes)

Pipeline pathway graphic: K-12 (college/career prep, dual enrollment, etc), college programs, post college programs (e.g., teacher residency), in-job programs and processes (e.g., housing; HR/negotiations such as sign-on bonuses for hard-to-recruit, or performance-based comp)
Detailed background

- **Pandemic-related labor shortages and increased demand have exacerbated chronic staffing challenges in public schools**
  - Increased demand: Record one-time funding for pandemic relief/learning acceleration and hiring (e.g., direct, non-profit partners)
  - Decreased supply: Vastly insufficient teacher credentialing rates, increased retirements, and burnout; salary and cost of living concerns
  - Nearly all educator roles impacted (e.g., administrators, teachers, counselors, nurses, social workers, psychologists, bus drivers, food service, custodians, etc.)
  - Trends parallels nationwide labor shortages across industries (e.g., healthcare)

- **Recent CA actions may help relieve short-term constraints and hold promise for the longer-term**
  - Potential short-term relief through Governor’s new executive order, CBEST/CSET and variable term waiver extension for teacher credentials, and longer-term through CDE work group and mental health counselor recruitment; CTC preliminary credential ‘clearing’ process/Induction training requirement and application processing lags not yet directly addressed
  - CDE convening task force

- **Similarly, potential opportunities remain for traditional public education workforce structures and processes, which**
  - Rely on limited LEA HR capacity (e.g., recruitment reliance on industry-specific tools and events); requirements for English fluency, on-site work potentially unnecessary for all jobs; partnerships with embassies and local teaching colleges limited; internal career-pathing support (e.g., job description libraries, HR staffing capacity) limited
  - May hinder collaboration toward student-centered goals (e.g., reliance on ‘interest-based bargaining’ between districts and labor groups rather than unified, student goal-oriented ‘teams’)
  - May not incentivize high-performing and younger/more diverse employees (e.g., salary schedules often with two-fold differences across steps/columns, limited incentives for high-demand specialties, and limited performance-based incentives)
  - Provide limited ‘on/off’ ramps from/to other professional industries, including high-demand specialties (e.g., STEM)
  - Weight lifetime compensation towards retirement benefits (i.e., pension), thus limiting employee wealth accrual at younger ages (e.g., young families).

- **Shortages are closely linked to insufficient workforce diversity**
  - San Mateo County highlighted in a recent Grand Jury Report with multiple mitigation strategies recommended - Housing, tuition reimbursement/loan forgiveness, etc.; nationwide education coalition targeting 1 million new teachers of color by 2020; potential additional opportunities through 4-year integrated undergraduate/credential programs (e.g., CSU-N), credentialing/student teaching stipends, and expanding pathways in and out of teaching to grow real-world experience and personal growth (e.g., industry summer internships, second-career STEM professionals, part-time VAPA/enrichment instructors)

- **Workforce spending typically ~90% of district budgets, thus potentially our greatest opportunity to increase school performance on student-oriented goals and financial efficiency, thus improving public trust and funding opportunities ahead**
References (4)

Governor issues new temporary executive order intended to address school staffing shortages

Gov. Gavin Newsom signed a temporary executive order on Tuesday, Jan. 11, aimed at increasing staffing flexibility in response to shortages caused by the current surge in COVID-19 cases. The order, which takes effect immediately and expires on March 31, will:

1. Allow local educational agencies to issue 30-day emergency substitute credentials without regard to whether the recipient has a pending credential or permit application, provided candidates have an undergraduate degree from a regionally accredited college or university and pass a criminal background check.

2. Lengthen the duration for which substitute teachers can be assigned to a single general education assignment from the current maximum of 60 days to the new limit of 120 days.

3. Permit student teachers to serve as teachers without the requirement that the student teacher be under the direct supervision of a certificated teacher in a classroom for purposes of calculating a school district’s average daily attendance for apportionment for each day, or portion of a day.

4. Continue existing financial incentives for retiree teachers. These incentives include suspension of certain post-retirement compensation limitations and suspension of the required 180-day service break — a suspension that applies to classified employees as well.

CSBA will provide additional analysis of the executive order as more information becomes available. In the meantime, you can read the order here and submit comments and questions to csba@csba.org.
References (6)

How important is it for you to work in a district with a diverse TEACHER/EDUCATOR workforce?

How important is it for you to work in a district with a racially/ethnically diverse STUDENT population?

To what extent do you agree or disagree that school districts should hire or seek to hire more teachers and school administrators from historically marginalized racial/ethnic groups?

How much of an effort is the school district you work for making to hire more teachers and school administrators from historically disadvantaged racial/ethnic groups?

Source: [How Do Educators Feel About Staff Diversity? We Asked](https://www.smcsba.org/)

**All Respondents**

- **No effort**: 10%
- **Small effort**: 24
- **Medium effort**: 35
- **Big effort**: 25

SOURCE: EdWeek Research Center survey, November 2021
California: The situation

Teacher Shortages in California

According to the US Department of Education Teacher Shortage Area report for 2021-2022, California broadly has the following shortages:

- Special Education, Pre-K-12
- Language Arts, Pre-K-12
- Mathematics, Pre-K-12
- Science, Pre-K-12
- Core Subjects (Elementary Education), Pre-K-6

Teacher retirements have had a significant impact in California due to the pandemic. During the 2020-21 school year, 13,538 of California’s teachers retired, which is about 1,000 more teachers than retired during the previous year, according to data from the California State Teachers’ Retirement System. This nearly 8% increase in retirements was unexpected and, as a result, most of the open positions were not filled by new teachers.

According to Mary Sandy at the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC), in order to keep up with the staffing needs of all districts in the state, the agency needs to credential around 20,000 new teachers each year. In 2020, the CTC only credential 14,000 new teachers, which is a shortage of 6,000 teachers.

What about substitute teachers? California has a shortage here too. The opposing forces at work during the pandemic–more teachers leaving and fewer new teachers being hired–have stressed the substitute teaching pool, so more subs are needed to fill these gaps. However, the number of subs in the state has trended down. The state only issued 47,000 substitute teaching permits in 2020-21, compared to 64,000 permits issued in the 2018-19 school year. The substitute teaching pool usually includes a large number of retired teachers, but with the pandemic, older people have likely shifted away from in-person teaching. As a result, school districts are getting creative in order to attract more substitute teachers by lowering their minimum requirements (e.g., no bachelor’s degree required, increased pay, etc.).

Somewhat offsetting the teacher shortage, student enrollment in California has been dropping due to declining birth rates; in the 2020-2021 year, 6,004,000 students are projected to be enrolled, down from 6,163,000 the prior year. This is a deficit of 155,000 students, or a 2.5% drop, a record one-year employment drop. The main drop was from pre-K and kindergarten.

According to the BLS, the number of Californians employed in the fields of elementary and secondary education at the start of the pandemic (January 2020) was around 100,000. As of September 2021, the number of people employed in education had partially rebounded from pandemic lows but was still only reported at 93,900, a 7% decrease.

Sources: EdSource, Teacher Certification Degrees, KTVU
In San Mateo County, 72% of public-school students enrolled in 2018-19 came from non-white groups yet only 25.8% of credentialed teachers came from those same groups according to data provided to the Grand Jury by the San Mateo County Office of Education.3

The Grand Jury recommends:

- Each school district should commit to teacher diversity in its strategic plan, goals or objectives, using the strategic plan developed by the San Mateo County Office of Education as a guide. These aspirational documents should be publicly and prominently displayed on their websites.

- The San Mateo County Office of Education should regularly sponsor teacher diversity forums for superintendents, district human resource managers, principals, and school board members. The forums should address the challenges school districts face to recruit teaching staff in general, and teachers of color in particular, and share best practices and strategic solutions. This should begin in advance of next year’s recruiting cycle.

- The San Mateo County Office of Education should expand its outreach to school districts and share the demographic data of all learners and educators in the County when its planned report is completed.

---

SMCSBA Equity Network – An Opportunity to Expand Workforce Diversity

In 2020, the San Mateo County School Boards Association (SMCSBA) launched Equity Network, a collaboration between school board members and their executive leadership teams working together to bring systemic change by addressing long-standing racial inequities. Approximately seventy school board members and educators from fifteen districts, including the San Mateo County Office of Education, are currently participating. To date, most districts have focused on specific practices that directly impact students with long histories of inequitable outcomes. The Grand Jury was informed that in subsequent years, several districts will support efforts to build a more diverse workforce.40 Although the SMCSBA has not focused specifically on promoting workforce diversity, the group is asking important fundamental questions:

- What are our hiring practices?
- Are district and school staff demographically reflective of the student body? If not, how are districts preparing staff to work with these students and communities?

40 Grand Jury interview.
2020-21 San Mateo County Grand Jury
San Mateo County: The progress (SMCOE)

- **Recruitment:** Educator credentialing programs
  - Preliminary Career and Technical Education (CTE) Teaching Credential
  - Preliminary, Clear Administrative Services Credential Programs
  - Teacher Induction (Clear) Program
  - *SMCOE K-12 Teacher Residency at Alder Graduate School of Education → SPOTLIGHT TODAY*

- **Retention:** Educator curriculum/instruction and professional development supports
  - Environmental literacy and sustainability
  - Outdoor education for teachers
  - CTE, college and career readiness
  - Learning events (e.g., ethnic studies, math milestones, mental health)

- **Also...**
  - *SMCOE strategic plan → SPOTLIGHT TODAY*
  - *Emergency substitute pilot with SFSU → SPOTLIGHT TODAY*
  - Alder TK Teacher Residency Program
  - *Sharing our Stories* series

Source: [SMCOE](#).
San Mateo County: The progress (SMCOE)

- **Recruitment:** Educator credentialing programs
  - Preliminary Career and Technical Education (CTE) Teaching Credential
  - Preliminary, Clear Administrative Services Credential Programs
  - Teacher Induction (Clear) Program
  - SMCOE K-12 Teacher Residency at Alder Graduate School of Education

- **Retention:** Educator curriculum/instruction and professional development supports
  - Environmental literacy and sustainability
  - Outdoor education for teachers
  - CTE, college and career readiness
  - Learning events (e.g., ethnic studies, math milestones, mental health)

- **Also...**
  - Alder TK Teacher Residency Program
  - Emergency substitute pilot with SFSU
  - **Sharing our Stories** series
  - SMCOE Equity workforce diversification strategies

Source: SMCOE.
Spotlight: SMCOE/Alder Teacher Residency Program

- College graduates can earn credential/Masters’ degree in 1 year through local apprenticeship; offers financial assistance
- Focus is on recruiting diversity of applicants
- Currently entering second semester of the program’s first year (7 SMC pilot districts), recruiting for expanded enrollment for next year and applying for a state-sponsored expansion grant

Source: San Mateo County Office of Education/Alder Teacher Residency.